Management Styles of Women Managers: Its Effect on Job Performance as Prime Mover to the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) Integration

Ma. Angela Josefa Gonzales Pioquinto

Camarines Norte State College, Daet, Camarines Norte, Philippines

ABSTRACT

This study aimed to explore the management styles of women managers and its effects on their job performance with the following objectives: to identify the management style of women managers as determined by the subordinates and the women managers themselves; to know the level of performance of women managers as rated by the subordinates and the women managers themselves; to find significant differences in the ratings given by the two groups of respondents namely the women managers and subordinates; to know if there is a significant relationship between the level of performance of women managers and their management styles; and to formulate management strategies that may be proposed to enhance performance of women managers as a prime mover for the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC).

To pursue the objectives of this study, a questionnaire was distributed to women managers and their subordinates. Moreover, descriptive statistics such as frequency and percentage was used for the profile of women managers. Weighted mean was also used to determine the level of performance of women managers as assessed by their subordinates and to identify the most used management style. T-test and Pearson R was also utilized for computing statistical data.

This study intended to propose management strategies to enhance the job performance of women managers and their subordinates. It is hopeful that these management strategies be adapted by women managers in Daet, Camarines Norte, the Philippines, and the members of the ASEAN (Association of Southeast Asian Nations), which may be of help to their organizational successes.

The following conclusions were obtained from the findings of the study: 1) The management style of the women managers as seen by majority of their subordinates is of the Autocratic style while the management style the women managers see themselves as possessing is the Laissez-Faire style of management. 2) The level of performance of women managers as rated by their subordinates is in the satisfactory evaluation level while as the women managers get to rate themselves in terms of their performance, they had given a straight Good result in the evaluation scale. 3) There is a significant difference on the ratings of women managers and their subordinates on the management styles of the women managers. There is also a significant difference on the ratings of women managers and their subordinates on the job performance of the women managers. 4) There is no significant relationship between the level of performance of women managers and their management styles. 5) The management strategies proposed by the researcher may substantiate and enhance the job performance of women managers in the Bicol Region, the Philippines and the ASEAN (Association of Southeast Asian Nations) Economic Community, into which our country is a member, and their subordinates, by being able to seek solutions to problems, foster group collaboration and camaraderie, implement strategic decisions and initiate organizational changes. Also, the focus of the proposed management strategies of the researcher that may be implemented to SME’s (Small Medium Enterprise) which is considered as the lifeblood of the economy of the member-nations of the ASEAN Economic Community.

Keywords: Management Styles; Women Managers; Job Performance

† Ma. Angela Josefa Gonzales Pioquinto, MM
Camarines Norte State College, Daet, Camarines Norte, Philippines
4600 Universidad de Sta. Isabel, Naga City, Philippines 4400
E-mail: agp710@yahoo.com
Introduction

Management is both a science and an art (Drucker, 2007). It is a science because it involves a step by step procedure in accomplishing a certain goal. Here, a manager, is able to make a plan wherein he/she will be able to apply a systematic procedure in all his dealings within the organization. A manager may be able to pose as a scientist in his own right by being able to do things that most scientists do, that is, to follow a step by step procedure and later on, make an analysis that may be of very much help in his leadership and management style. On the other hand, management is an art because in managing, an expert is needed, an artist who is an expert in designing an abstract idea as to what will be his course of action, and who will be able to make a certain style in whatever objective he has to make to be a step nearer his goal. An artist usually imagines things. He usually envisions what his goals are. This is an attitude that a manager must possess for him to lead the organization into a brighter future.

Managers are the basic resource of the business enterprise. In a fully automated business environment, there may not be workers or technicians or professionals present at all. But there will always be managers. (Drucker, 2011). A manager is the leader of any organization, be it a profit or a non-profit organization. He is the one responsible of planning, organizing, staffing, leading, and controlling an organization. Everything in it depends on a good manager. A good manager must be someone who knows of his clientele, his environment, and most especially his competitors.

In the present generation of technology and the digital era, women managers emerged victorious in their own rights. When given 10 seconds, we can readily name at least five role models of women managers and women leaders who are or were both liked and in charge of an organization. In the different fields of society, women managers and women leaders do excel, be it in the medical world, the political world, the social world and in particular, the business world.

Management is too complex to be done perfectly. And women are known to be completely complex individuals. Today, women managers are highly acceptable in the business world, and they are running companies. Three types of managers can be identified. They can either be one of these three (3) types. First is the autocratic manager. He/She makes all the decisions, tells employees what to do, and closely supervises the employees. The second type of manager is the democratic manager. He/she is one who encourages employee participation in decisions, works with employees to determine what to do, and does not supervise closely the employees. The third type of manager is the laissez-faire manager. She/he is one who takes a leave-employees-alone approach, allowing them to make the decisions and decide what to do, and does not follow up.

In January 2012, women comprised 35.4% of all management positions and 22.9% of all senior management positions according the Canadian Labour Statistics. This is an achievement for women who had been in the working force. These may be milestones - not just for women in business - but for women all over the world making career choices. To get to know some famous women CEO’s from the US, we can name a few such as: Mary Kay Ash, the founder and CEO of the famous Mary Kay cosmetics; Meg Whitman, President and CEO of eBay Technologies; Andrea Jung, President and CEO of Avon Products; Anne Mulcahy, Chairman and CEO of Xerox Corporation; Brenda Barns, CEO of Sara Lee; Sheryl Sandberg, CEO of Facebook; Marissa Mayer, CEO of Yahoo! The list of women achievers in the field of business in the US and the western countries are quite impressive. (John Gettings 2007)

In Asia however, only Australia and Singapore have a large number of women in senior management according to an Asian magazine, The Economist (Business World 2012). Elsewhere in Asia, the picture is mostly dire because majority of the countries are below the poverty line. One reason why so few women in Asia get plum jobs is that in most countries, far fewer of them are in the work force than those in
Ma. Angela Josefi Gonzales Pioquinto

the West, where women labor force participation rate is higher. Education is also another factor to be considered.

In the Philippines, although many women are said to be well-educated, only two Filipino women are among the 25 Most Influential Women in Asia Pacific’s Asset Management Scene (Philippine Daily Inquirer, March 25, 2014). These two Filipinas are named as: Maria Theresa Marcel Javier of the Bank of the Philippine Islands and who presently serves as its Senior Vice President. The second Filipina is Ramona Gertrudes Santiago, who is the Assistant Governor and Head of Treasury of the Bangko Sentral Ng Pilipinas. They were both cited by Asian Investors as among the few female movers and shakers in the region’s Asset Management Industry. It can already be seen that women managers in the Philippines mostly come from the big cities within the country. In Bicol alone, the business industry has not yet cited women managers who are recognized to be achievers except for the trio of women managers who are the founders of Bigg’s Diner, a purely Bicolano company. Nena Bichara, Nienie Buenaflor and Maricar Manjon started their business venture in Naga City in 1983. Their venture proved that women managers may be very successful even locally. In Daet, Camarines Norte, Mrs. Delfina Dolor, proprietor of DVS Dolor Marketing and a 2014 Halyao Awardee “Bicolano Business Person of the Year” by the Metro Naga Chamber of Commerce and Industry, also proved that women managers from as far as Daet, Camarines Norte, may be given due recognition in Naga City with their exemplary achievements. The education sector also has a huge share of women managers. In the Department of Education Regional Office V, almost more than 50% of Education Planning Supervisors are women. In Private Schools, a number of women managers are also holding management position especially in Camarines Norte.

The evolution of women managers with the most effective management style may help women to be able to develop better job performance levels. Their management style may be democratic, autocratic, or laissez-faire. Whatever a woman manager’s style may be, a better job performance is expected of her to be considered as a successful manager.

A good woman manager, therefore, is a person with integrity, one who is committed to the organization and the people whom she works together to accomplish the organizational mission. A good woman manager leads by example, communicates without ceasing, and shows care, concern and consistency in all her dealings.

This study may be very beneficial for the researcher and to other women managers for them to have a complete knowledge and know what subordinates really think of their leadership and management styles being women as they are. Also as a woman manager herself, the researcher can assess as to what management style is more preferred by subordinates. An additional knowledge as to what management and leadership style should a woman manager show subordinates in their daily works, is of great importance to the researcher.

A. Statement of the Problem

The study intended to assess the management styles of women managers and its effects on job performance. Specifically, it aimed to answer the following questions:

1. What is the management style of women managers as determined by the subordinates and the women managers themselves?
2. What is the level of performance of women managers as rated by the subordinates and the women managers themselves?
3. Are there significant differences in the ratings given by the two groups of respondents?
4. Is there a significant relationship between the level of performance of women managers and their management styles?
5. What management strategies may be proposed to enhance performance of women managers as prime mover for the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC)?
B. Scope and Delimitation

The study focused on the management styles of women managers in Daet, Camarines Norte and its effects on job performance. The respondents of this study were fifty seven (57) women managers in the corporate sector such as in banks and insurance companies, and educational institutions, such as private and public schools, all in Daet, Camarines Norte. One hundred and fifty three (153) subordinates of these women managers were also used as respondents.

The schedule of the distribution and answering of the survey questionnaire on management styles of women managers and the job performance questionnaire started in the last week of August and was finally completed in the third week of September 2014.

Other businesses such as lending institutions, commercial retailing businesses, cooperatives, and small businesses and the likes are not included in the study.

II. Literature Reviews

A. Related Literature

Women managers have comparable and different management styles in managing an organization, but generally, they all agree that the managerial competencies of women managers are essential in performing their everyday jobs. The literatures read dealt on management styles of managers in general, and women managers in particular, that provided the researcher with information in the management styles of men and women managers both in the foreign and local settings.

1. Management Style

Lussier (2009) identified three (3) types of leaders. First is the autocratic leader, he/she makes all the decisions, tells employees what to do, and closely supervises the employees. The second type of leader is the democratic leader. He/she is one who encourages employee participation in decisions, works with employees to determine what to do and does not supervise closely the employees. The third type of leader is the laissez-faire leader. She/he is one who takes a leave-employees-alone approach, allowing them to make the decisions and decide what to do, and does not follow up.

Martires and Fule (2010) say that management style is a pattern of behavior and action that leaders make over a period as perceived by followers. Style on the other hand is the visible aspect of leadership. It is a manifestation of a leaders’ assumption, philosophies and attitudes. A leader usually faces different problems, large and small. Nevertheless, in order to manage the people better, a leader must know how to motivate them, boost their morale, and solve their personal problems sometimes.

Zarate (2012) on the other hand, generalizes organizational management in the Philippine setting. In her book, she gave examples of organizations and as to what type of management or organizational style that a leader is implementing. She also gave special mention of a leader having his/her best foot forward whenever the needs arise and a leaders’ very clean point of view according to company goals was also given emphasis.

2. Women Managers

Kouzes and Posner (2007) state that effectiveness most often, depends upon the fit between the setting and the management gender. Women managers are typically more mentoring, coaching style is more favorably received in female dominated professions. While men are more typically “command and control” style is well received in male dominated environment. They also stated that women have been shown to be slightly more likely than men to have transformational leadership style, in which the manager act more like a good teacher or coach and encourage active solutions to problems.

According to Gary Yukl (2012), successful leaders are capable of adapting to changed circumstances,
aware of the social environment, ambitious and assertive, willing to cooperate with others and decisive when making decisions. They can be trusted, they tend to assume a dominant role with a group, and they have energy and are persistent, be they are male or female. They have self-confidence, they can absorb a great deal of stress and they are willing to take on a role of responsibility.

Certo (2007) described managers and leaders, both male and female with the following characteristics that they should possess: Intelligence, including judgment and verbal ability; Past achievement in scholarship and athletics; Emotional maturity and stability; Dependability, persistence and a drive for continuing achievement; The skill to participate socially and adapt to various groups; A desire for status and socio-economic position. These as Certo enumerated, are all the traits that managers, in general must possess.

In the 21st Century, there are very relevant leadership and management issues; this was stated by Robbins and Coulter (2007). A person, who is called manager must have the following powers: The legitimate power wherein the power of the manager has is a result of his or her position; The expert power wherein the influence of a leader can exert as a result of his or her expertise, skills or knowledge; The coercive power is the power a leader has to punish or control; Reward power is the power to give positive benefits or rewards; Referent power is the power of a leader that arise because of a person’s desirable resources or admired personal traits.

These powers as enumerated are the perks that a manager has of being the leader of an organization.

Robbins and DeCenzo (2008) differentiated managers versus leaders. The said that “Not all leaders are managers, nor are all managers leaders.” The quoted that managers are persons whose influence on others is limited to the appointed managerial authority of their positions to reward and punish. While leaders are persons with managerial and personal power who can influence others to perform actions beyond those that could be dictated by those persons’ formal (position) authority alone.

Andres (2007) particularly pointed out in his book that Filipino culture is a very big part in establishing a career in the Philippines especially for women managers. He pointed out that the paternalistic form of authority in the Filipino family had established a very big role in giving high career opportunities to women. Here, it was known that the society is not yet ready to embrace the concept of the equality between men and women managers.

Adeyemo (2013) in his book about the process of decision making cites pertinent examples of how Filipino managers decide when given a very critical situation. He stated that religion and culture takes a very big part of the process of decision making of many Filipino managers, may they be male or female. This is simply because of our Filipino family upbringing that was influenced by our long ago colonizers and ancestors as well.

This was also supported by Atienza (2012) in his book about transformative organizational management. Our having very close family ties, as Filipinos, sometimes do not help us to become better managers. We simply live in an environment that clearly focuses on respect to elders and “maximum tolerance” especially for family members.

Kouzes and Posner (2008) developed a survey that asked people which, of a list of common characteristics of leaders, were, with their experiences of being led by others, the same things that they look for, admire and would willingly follow. And the result of the survey states that majority of the things that an employee looks for in a manager is possessed by women managers.

The United States Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics’ Occupational Outlook Handbook (2013) declared that nearly one out of four Chief Executives is now a woman. It reflects the number of women who own their own businesses also. In Fortune 500 – women held about 1 out of 20 top management positions.

3. Job Performance

Hackman and Oldham (2008) said that job
performance could be affected by situational factors such as characteristics of the job, the organization and the co-workers. Dispositional variables can be described as personality characteristics, needs, attitudes, preferences and motives that result in a tendency to react to situations in a predetermined manner. Job performance is influenced by aptitude, need for achievement, self-regard, loss of control, effective temperament and the interaction between these constructs.

Good work performance from staff, results in greater organizational effectiveness. Identifying the factors that contribute to a successful performance is a key priority for organizations. Prediction of an individual’s work performance usually begins at recruitment and judgments here, and later throughout employment are often based on an assessment of an individual’s competencies in relation to the company’s competency framework. (Fletcher, 2007)

Individual job performance is generally determined by these factors which are: motivation; the desire to do the job; ability, capability to do the job and the work environment; the tools, materials and information needed to do the job. If an employee lacks ability, the manager can provide training or replace the worker. (Buckham, n.d., 2007)

Hogan, Tulsa, Mount and Motowidlo (2006) all agreed that “contextual performance” leads to good job performance. Contextual performance means doing things beyond the simple job performance such as volunteering, putting in extra effort, cooperating, following rules and procedures, and endorsing the goals of the organization.

B. Related Studies

In order to have a relevant study and wider range of ideas, past researchers’ works were evaluated. This portion covers the findings, conclusion and recommendation as well as methodologies and designs of related studies that can be used as basis of this study.

1. Management Styles

In the study of Tusiine (2008) about “Managerial Competence in Performance Management and Control”, a structured questionnaire was employed to collect data. It was administered to 50 public and private organizations. Respondents from these organizations comprised of top and middle management level employees. Results obtained from statistical analysis of the data using SPSS show that Performance Management Competences, Employee Competency and Personnel Management of Involvement Competency strongly, significantly and positively correlate with Personnel Management and Control. These findings demonstrate that organizations maximize in identification and development of critical performance management competency, appropriate human resource orientation and participation and involvement of all relevant stakeholders will realize positive improvements in performance management and control, thereby leading to productivity.

Llenado (2004) in his study on “Managerial Competence Management-The Organizational Learning Contribution” emphasized the contribution of the organization learning theory in order to develop managerial competence. Managerial competence is still seen based on an established ideal principle. It noted that there is a tendency to build ambitious competence attributes, whether for its abstraction or diversity. In other words, organizational learning theory has been used as the basis to develop a proposal where managerial competencies are developed through informal practices combined with an articulated development strategy.

Vengco’s (2011) research about the “Managerial Competence in Smaller Organizations” revealed that the lack of managerial competence is commonly cited. The primary reason for the failure of smaller companies to perform their potentials. She suggested that the development of managerial competence may rely less on formal certification process than often assumed, thus, limiting the role of the business employees in making competent managers.
Vargas’ (2010) study revealed also that although Municipal Agrarian Reform Officers are effective in planning and moderately effective in organizing, staffing, leading and controlling, there is no significant relationship between managerial effectiveness and job performance. Moreover, there is no significant difference between the perceptions of the two groups of raters, (the manager herself and her subordinates) on managerial effectiveness.

2. Women Managers

Women were perceived to be more successful in female-oriented settings and males in male-oriented settings. Women had also been found to be more democratic, encourages participation and men more autocratic and directing performance. This is according to an unpublished study by Eagly and Johnson (2008). They also found out that women appear to reward good performances of subordinates’ more than male managers.

Gayao’s (2009) research about “Competence of Middle-Level Managers of the Seventh-Day Adventist Tertiary Institutions of Southern Philippines” discussed the following topics: Middle-level managers and instructors profile; Middle-level managers level of managerial competence; Significant difference in the middle-level managers level of managerial competence when grouped according to profile; Teaching performance of college instructors; Significant difference in the teaching performance of college instructors when grouped according to profile; and Significant relationship between the middle-level managers managerial competencies and the teaching performance of college instructors.

Devillard, et.al. (2013) in a study of Gender Sensitivity in Top Management concluded that in depth measures of a company can help women achieve progress toward top management positions. The research further revealed that a whole ecosystem of such measures is needed. It had also shown that in addition to creating this ecosystem measures, companies must also work hard to transform mindsets and culture. These are crucial elements in the achievement of gender diversity. If left unattended, they can become persistent hindrances to progressive development, no matter how many and well-designed are the measures advocating for women leaders.

Kloot (2007) in a research “Women and Leadership in Universities: A Case Study of Women Academic Managers” said that gender inequality at senior ranks in Australian sector universities has long been recognized as a major problem. Suggestions to improve the retention of senior women managers include nominating a change agent to provide support and encouragement, more transparent organizational processes and structures and changes in hiring practices.

Green, Jegadeesh and Tang (2007) in their study investigated the relation between gender and job performance among brokerage firm equity analysts. They found out that women significantly are more likely to be designated by Institutional Investor Manager as masters of the All-American Research Team which indicates that women may be better at non-quantifiable aspects of job performance such as client services.

Espiritu (2011) conducted a study on managerial competence of school heads and its relationship to teacher and pupil’s performance, revealed that there is a significant relationship between managerial competence and teacher’s performance when school heads management style is favorable and acceptable to teacher and is democratic but skillful in exercising his duties enabling teachers to be motivated to achieve high performance.

III. Research Design and Methodology

This chapter presents a discussion of the research methodology, source of data and data gathering procedures. This likewise includes the research instruments to be utilized and the document analysis framework. An analytical framework is provided as guide in analyzing the information and data to be
gathered from various sources.

A. Research Method

The researcher used the descriptive-comparative-correlational methods of research in this study. The descriptive methods were used to find out the management styles of women managers as rated by subordinates and the women managers themselves. This was also used to determine their level of performance.

The comparative method was used to compare the ratings given by their subordinates and by themselves as to their management style and their level of job performance as well.

B. Subjects

The study involved women managers in Daet, Camarines Norte. They are the women managers in various fields such as corporate entity as in banks and insurance companies.

Furthermore, it also included employees or subordinates of these women managers. The table presented below as to the distribution of respondents.

The table presents the Profile of the Respondent Women Managers. It shows the distribution of these women managers according to their age, civil status, educational attainment and their number of years in service. The data revealed that six (6) women managers or 10.5% of the total women manager respondents age range from 31-40 years old. Twenty (20) women managers or 35.1% are of 41-50 years of age. Moreover, thirty one (31) of these women managers or a large 54.4% are 51 years old and above.

The civil status of these women managers revealed that ten (10) of them or 17.6% are still single. Forty five (45) or 78.9% of the respondent women managers are married and Two (2) or 3.5% are separated from their husbands.

Educational attainment of the women manager respondents showed that twenty one (21) or 36.8% are College Graduates while thirty seven (37) of them or 63.2% are already in the Graduate School Level.

On the number of years: twelve (12) women managers or 21.1% have been in the service for 6-10 years in a company. Furthermore, forty five (45) or 78.9% have been in the service for more than 11 years.

C. Data Gathering Instrument

The instrument that was used in the study was a leadership styles questionnaire by Peter G. Northouse(2013). This questionnaire was both for the women managers and for their subordinates. It is an assessment in a checklist form where women managers rated themselves with regard to their management style and at the same time their subordinates rated their women managers on the leadership style used by their respective managers. Another questionnaire was formulated for the ratings of the job performance. This was patterned from the University of Fraser Valley Employment Services.

Copies of the questionnaire were distributed to all respondents. The researcher facilitated the collection, analysis and interpretation of data gathered.
D. Data Gathering Procedure

To gather relevant information, data were utilized in the study, the following series of steps were done. First, a letter to conduct a research was made by the researcher and given to the chosen corporate and educational institutions with women managers. Afterwards, the questionnaire were distributed to the chosen respondents in the corporate banks and insurance companies as well as with the private and public educational institutions.

Most questionnaires were answered on the spot with the guidance of the researcher. While, some were retrieved after 3-4 days upon distribution. Follow-up conversation to individual respondents was also made by the researcher for clarification of useful insights and additional ideas.

E. Statistical Treatment

To pursue the objectives of this study, the results were tallied, tabulated and analyzed. Statistical computations were utilized in gathering the important data of the study. Descriptive statistics such as frequency and percentage were used for the profile of the women managers. To determine the level of performance of women managers as assessed by their subordinates, weighted mean was used.

To identify the most used management style by the respondents, weighted mean was computed and the ranking method was employed. SPSS version 19 was used in the statistical treatment of data. T-test and Pearson R were used to test the research hypotheses.

IV. Analysis

This chapter presents, discusses, analyzes and interprets the information derived for the purpose of this study. The management style of women managers and its effects on their job performance are shown here. The discussion of the data is arranged chronologically according to the problems of the study.

A. Management Style of Women Managers Norte as Determined by the Subordinates and the Women Managers Themselves

Table 2 shows the management styles of the women managers as determined by their subordinates and the women managers themselves.

The management styles of women managers as shown in table 2 are the autocratic, democratic, and the laissez-faire management style. According to fifty nine (59) subordinates, they had determined that their woman boss is practicing an autocratic management style, while zero (0) or no one said that their woman manager is practicing the democratic style of management. However, 43 of the subordinates had determined their woman manager of having a democratic management style. Moreover, fifty one (51) of them also had determined that their woman manager possess a laissez-faire style of management.

In the part of the women managers themselves, only one (1) of them had determined herself as the autocratic manager and fifty six (56) women managers determined their management style as laissez-faire.

The said findings imply that as determined by the subordinates, women managers are possessing the autocratic form of management style into which the woman manager makes all the decisions, tells

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Management Style</th>
<th>Subordinates</th>
<th>Women Managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Autocratic Management Style</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic Management Style</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laissez-Faire Management Style</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
employees what to do and closely supervises her employees. However, the women managers determined their management style as the laissez-faire into which she makes a leave-employees-alone approach. This allows employees to make decisions by themselves.

According to Jayasingam (2009) no gender differences were noticed for autocratic leaders. Generally, as autocratic leadership is deemed ineffective on the whole, it is possible that this style is no longer associated with effectiveness regardless of whether a man or woman manager utilizes it.

However, Eagly (2008) cited that a meta-analysis of 45 studies of transformational, transactional, and laissez-faire leadership styles found that female leaders were more transformational than male leaders and also engaged in more of the contingent reward behaviors that are a component of transactional leadership. Male leaders were generally more likely to manifest the other aspects of transactional leadership (active and passive management by exception) and laissez-faire leadership.

The findings in the research may be in harmony with that of Jayasingam (2009) for it says that the gender of a manager is not a determinant with his/her management style. However, in the study of Eagly (2008) it was cited that the male managers were the ones who mostly possess the laissez-faire management style.

B. Level of Performance of Women Managers as Rated by the Subordinates and the Women Managers Themselves

Table 3 presents the level of performance of the women managers as rated by the subordinates and the women managers themselves. Here, the questionnaire on job performance from the Fraser Valley Employment Services was utilized wherein twenty eight questions (28) were answered.

The average scores shows that 1-1.49 exhibits an excellent performance level; 1-5-2.49 exhibits a good performance level; 2.5-3.49 exhibits a satisfactory level of performance; 3.5-4.49 is sometimes unsatisfactory level of performance and finally, 4.5-5 shows an unsatisfactory level of performance by the woman manager as what is rated by her subordinates and the woman manager herself.

The level of performance of women managers as rated by their subordinates and the women managers themselves is shown in Table 3. Here, twenty eight (28) questions were given ratings by the two (2) groups and an equivalent evaluation scale was also being shown.

The questions in the questionnaire may be grouped into six (6) clusters. They are namely: Punctuality, Work Efficiency, Customer Service, Team Work, Initiative and Reliability, and Observance of Policy.

Cluster 1 involves Punctuality of a woman manager includes items 1,2, and 3. Here the arrival to work and to meeting on time was stated. Also meeting work deadline was also mentioned. The rating of the women managers was evaluated as good and the subordinates’ rating fell in the scale of satisfactory and good.

Cluster 2 deals with Work Efficiency of the women managers. Items numbers 4,5,7 and 8 fell into this group. Identifying problems, proposing solutions to problems, Setting appropriate priorities and using time effectively clearly summarizes this cluster. The rating of women managers were all good and the subordinates’ rating ranged from satisfactory to good.

Cluster 3 refers to customer service which involves items 17 and 18. It states appropriate interactions with students and appropriate interactions with the public. Here, the women managers’ rating were good while those of the subordinates again ranged from satisfactory to good.

Cluster 4 refers to customer service which involves items 17 and 18. It states appropriate interactions with students and appropriate interactions with the public. Here, the women managers’ rating were good while those of the subordinates again ranged from satisfactory to good.

Team Work, the fourth cluster dealt with items number 9,13,14,15,23,24,25,26,27,28. These items all pertains to working of the woman manager and of her subordinates together with harmony and creativity. In this cluster, the importance of being in a team with a group of people is exhibited. The women managers’ rating again were all evaluated as good and those of the subordinates again ranged...
Table 3. Level of Performance of Women Managers as Rated by Subordinates and Women Managers Themselves

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>WOMEN MANAGERS</th>
<th>SUBORDINATES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Arrives to work on time.</td>
<td>1.89 Good</td>
<td>2.76 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Arrives for meetings on time.</td>
<td>1.89 Good</td>
<td>1.94 Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Meets work deadlines.</td>
<td>1.88 Good</td>
<td>2.07 Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Identifies problems.</td>
<td>1.87 Good</td>
<td>2.99 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Proposes solutions to problems.</td>
<td>1.84 Good</td>
<td>3.00 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Takes appropriate action on problems as necessary.</td>
<td>1.84 Good</td>
<td>2.82 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Sets appropriate priorities for tasks.</td>
<td>1.83 Good</td>
<td>2.59 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Uses time effectively.</td>
<td>1.80 Good</td>
<td>1.97 Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Consults with supervisors and co-workers as necessary.</td>
<td>1.79 Good</td>
<td>2.00 Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Works without supervision as necessary.</td>
<td>1.76 Good</td>
<td>2.80 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Demonstrates effective leadership skills as appropriate.</td>
<td>1.78 Good</td>
<td>3.00 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Demonstrates initiative as appropriate.</td>
<td>1.80 Good</td>
<td>2.80 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Effectively collaborates with other department members as necessary.</td>
<td>1.81 Good</td>
<td>2.88 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Deals effectively and professionally with employees in other areas.</td>
<td>1.86 Good</td>
<td>2.92 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Responds appropriately to feedback on job performance.</td>
<td>1.92 Good</td>
<td>3.00 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Demonstrates appropriate knowledge on company policies/practices relevant to position.</td>
<td>1.90 Good</td>
<td>3.00 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Demonstrates appropriate interactions with students.</td>
<td>1.89 Good</td>
<td>1.13 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Demonstrates appropriate interactions with public.</td>
<td>1.90 Good</td>
<td>2.00 Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Deals appropriately with confidential information.</td>
<td>1.89 Good</td>
<td>2.58 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Deals appropriately with sensitive situations.</td>
<td>1.89 Good</td>
<td>2.54 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Manages data and information effectively.</td>
<td>1.88 Good</td>
<td>2.81 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Gives clear guidance in support of unit objectives.</td>
<td>1.90 Good</td>
<td>2.44 Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Gives clear guidance in support with daily tasks.</td>
<td>1.90 Good</td>
<td>2.62 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Gives recognition for good performance.</td>
<td>1.92 Good</td>
<td>3.00 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Offers appropriate assistance to new employees supervised.</td>
<td>1.94 Good</td>
<td>2.86 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. Is fair to all employees supervised</td>
<td>1.95 Good</td>
<td>1.65 Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Is accessible to all employees supervised.</td>
<td>1.93 Good</td>
<td>3.01 Satisfactory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28. Works to establish and maintain a positive relationship with all employees supervised.</td>
<td>1.94 Good</td>
<td>2.16 Good</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rating: 1-1.49 Excellent; 1.5-2.49 Good; 2.5-3.49 Satisfactory; 3.5-4.49 Sometimes Unsatisfactory; 4.5-5 Unsatisfactory

The fifth cluster of Initiative and Reliability had items 6,10,11,12 and 21. These items all dealt with the ability of a woman manager to work independently and be able to make decisions sternly. Here the woman manager shows her subordinates and the company that they can always count on her any time and in any situation. Good was what the women managers rated themselves. The subordinates ratings ranged from satisfactory to good also.

The last cluster of Observance of Policy particularly company policies, Items 16,19,20,22 were into this group. The ability of the woman manager to be a model employee of the company where she works for is being shown here. It will be evaluated if she observes rules and regulations
Table 4. Significant Differences In Management Styles of Women Managers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ratings According to Women Managers</td>
<td>2.821</td>
<td>2.529</td>
<td>.016</td>
<td>Significant Difference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subordinates</td>
<td>2.378</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

of the company. Good was the rating of the women managers while the subordinates ranged their rating from satisfactory to good.

It can be observed that women managers rated themselves with a Good rating throughout, in all of the items written. It is simply because that they believe in themselves that their job performance is simply of high standard. Moreover, the ratings given by the subordinates of their women managers’ job performance is a combination of Good and Satisfactory. It can be noticed that there is a very thin line between the Good and Satisfactory ratings. The ratings of both the women managers and the subordinates may be evaluated as almost synchronized with each other.

This pattern of rating of women managers by themselves was also to be well seen in the book of Baumeister (2011). He stated that managers when asked to rate themselves and compare their self-ratings to the average ratings by their subordinates. Self-ratings tend to be overrated given individuals’ tendency to self-enhance, especially if they are reasonably high in self-esteem. Also, the assumption behind averaging others’ ratings is that this will provide a clearer focus on the true performance eliminating variability in any disagreement between raters. Of course, such disagreements may indeed be true in what raters see their managers from different perspectives for good reasons, such as the raters’ behavior and performance differing and managers treating them differently. Moreover, differences between self-ratings and ratings from others are likely to induce recipients’ defensiveness when others’ ratings are lower than self-ratings, which is likely to be the case given in self-enhancement biases by women managers.

C. Significant Differences In the Ratings Given By the Two Groups of Respondents

1. Management Styles

The respondents were the Women managers who rated themselves as to what management style they are implementing, and the subordinates as to their observation of what management style their women bosses are possessing.

The Table 4 presents the significant difference in the management styles of women managers as rated by themselves and their subordinates. A T test value of 2.529 and a sig. value of .016 indicate that there is a significant difference in the rating of the management styles or women managers. What the subordinates see as the style of management by their women bosses was totally significantly different as to what the women managers see themselves. Having identified a different management style from those of their subordinates, the women managers here clearly show that what they see themselves as a projection of their management style towards their subordinates is totally different from what their subordinates see them.

The result runs counter with the result of the study of Copley (2008), there was a significant difference of management styles of managers as perceived by subordinates and themselves, the greater a leader’s competence as perceived by the follower, the greater the probability that the follower will transact goods with him. We should expect the leader’s information, skills, and personal temperament to be important factors influencing the formation and maintenance of follower commitments. Competence to cope with the instrumental tasks of the group is an important criterion in selecting leaders, for it is through the leader’s successful performance of his instrumental
functions that rewards are accumulated by individual followers.

2. Job Performance

The respondents were the Women managers who rated themselves as to what is their job performance, and the subordinates as to their observation of what is the level of job performance their women bosses have.

Table 5 presents the significant difference in the job performance of women managers as rated by themselves and their subordinates. A T test value of -7.197 and a sig. value of .000 indicate that there is a significant difference in the rating of the job performance of women managers. The subordinates see the job performance of their women bosses was totally significantly different as to what the women managers see themselves. These may had originated from the fact that the perspective of women managers are totally different from those of their subordinates. These difference in their individual perspectives triggered the fact that the results of their observations towards job performances were totally different from each other.

The findings implied is supported by an academic research which has indicated that these subordinate appraisals were not only more cost effective as compared with assessment centers, but were also better predictors of managerial performance. However, it is evident there was only a slight significant difference between the ratings of job performance of the women managers to themselves and the ratings by their subordinates.

D. Significant Relationship Between the Level of Performance of Women Managers and Their Management Styles

The level of job performance by women managers was tested if it has a significant relationship on the management style they possess or practice.

Table 6 illustrates the significant relationship of the level of job performance and the management styles of women managers. The correlation of management styles vs job performance shows Pearson Correlation value of .101 and a sig. value of .456.

This clearly implies that there is no significant relationship as to whatever management style does a woman manager possess and the level of job performance that she does in her every day work. Although many would think otherwise, the quality of a woman manager’s management style has no direct effect on her job performance. Even though the woman manager is an autocratic, democratic or laizzes-faire type of manager, her job performance will not be directly influenced by this. Moreover, her job performance will basically depend on her

| Table 5. Significant Differences In Job Performance of Women Managers |
|---------------------------------|--------|--------|-------------------|---------------|
| Ratings According to Women Managers to Subordinates | Mean   | t      | Sig               | Remarks       |
| 1.8711                                                                                     | -7.197.000 | Significant Difference |
| 2.5479                                                                                     | 2.5479  |                |

| Table 6. Significant Relationship Between Level of Performance of Women Managers and Their Management Styles |
|---------------------------------|--------|--------|-------------------|---------------|
| Variables                      | Pearson| Sig   | Remarks            |
| Management Styles              | .101   | .456  | No Significant Relationship |
| Job Performance                |        |       |                    |
E. Proposed Management Strategies to Enhance Job Performance of Women Managers as prime mover for the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC)

V. Conclusions and Recommendations

This study aimed to explore the management styles of women managers and its effects on their job performance with the following objectives: to identify the management style of women managers as determined by the subordinates and the women managers themselves; to know the level of performance of women managers as rated by the

Table 7. Proposed Management Strategies to Enhance Job Performance of Women Managers and Their Subordinates

| MANAGEMENT STRATEGY 1. Provide employees the opportunity to assess themselves and their women managers |
|---|---|---|---|
| Objectives | Activities | Persons Involved | Time Frame |
| To let employees track of their job performances | paper and pen evaluation | women managers | 1 day |
| To let employees assess the job performance of the woman managers | open forum during meetings | employees | 1 day |

| MANAGEMENT STRATEGY 2. Gather information from a variety of sources about employees’ performance |
|---|---|---|---|
| Objectives | Activities | Persons Involved | Time Frame |
| To let employees track of their job performances | paper and pen evaluation | women managers | 1 day |
| To let employees know of other’s impressions | interview | costumers | 1 day |

| MANAGEMENT STRATEGY 3. Help employees know the impact of their performance with regards to company/organization vision |
|---|---|---|---|
| Objectives | Activities | Persons Involved | Time Frame |
| To let employees track of their job performances | paper and pen evaluation | women managers | 1 day |
| To let employees assess their job performance in relation to company vision | open forum during meetings | employees | 1 day |

| MANAGEMENT STRATEGY 4. Provide continuing opportunities for advancement |
|---|---|---|---|
| Objectives | Activities | Persons Involved | Time Frame |
| To let employees grow professionally. | graduate school | women managers and subordinates | 2-3 years |
| To enhance knowledge and intellectual creativity | seminars | | occasional |
| | trainings | | |

| MANAGEMENT STRATEGY 5 Reward System through employee evaluation |
|---|---|---|---|
| Objectives | Activities | Persons Involved | Time Frame |
| To let employees track of their job performances | bonuses | women managers | occasional |
| To let employees experience the fruit of hard work | foreign travel or domestic travel | employees | |
| | tech gadgets | | |
subordinates and the women managers themselves; to find significant differences in the ratings given by the two groups of respondents namely the women managers and subordinates; to know if there is a significant relationship between the level of performance of women managers and their management styles; and to formulate management strategies that may be proposed to enhance performance of women managers and their subordinates.

**Problem 1.**

What is the management style of women managers as determined by the subordinates and the women managers themselves?

**Findings:**

The management style of women managers as determined by their subordinates is that of Autocratic Management Style wherein 59 of 153 subordinates or 38.6% of them had actually pointed out. Not a single subordinate chose the Democratic Management Style. However, 43 subordinates or 28% determined their women bosses as possessing a management style of a combination of Autocratic and Laissez-Faire. Moreover, 51 of the 153 subordinates or 33.3% determined that their women bosses’ management style is that of Laissez-Faire.

The management style that the women managers determined themselves to be at work is that of the Laissez-Faire management style with 56 out of 57 of them rating themselves. However, only 1 women manager had determined themselves to be Autocratic leaders.

**Conclusion:**

It can therefore be concluded that the management style of the women managers as seen by majority of their subordinates is of the Autocratic style wherein she makes all the decisions, tells her employees what to do and supervises the employees. The management style, the Laissez-Faire, which is the complete opposite of the management style the subordinates had determined, was what the women managers had seen themselves to have had practiced in their organizations.

**Recommendations:**

It is recommended for the women managers to experiment and innovate with other approaches when it comes to their management styles. A need to intensify collaboration in dealing with subordinates of the issues and challenges in an organization is likewise encouraged.

**Problem 2.**

What is the level of performance of women managers as rated by the subordinates and the women managers themselves?

**Findings:**

The level of performance of women managers as rated by their subordinates yielded a rating that ranged from a majority of 2.5 to 3.49 which translated to a Satisfactory rating from the evaluation scale. Moreover, the level of performance of women managers as rated by themselves had straight ratings from 1.5-2.49 which translated to a Good rating from the evaluation scale.

**Conclusion:**

I therefore conclude that the level of performance of women managers as rated by their subordinates is in between the Satisfactory and Good evaluation level wherein the performance of the women manager consistently meets acceptable performance levels as to what their subordinates had seen. However, as the women managers get to rate themselves in terms of their performance, they had given a straight Good result in the evaluation scale. It means that according to the women managers themselves, their performance is occasionally above acceptable performance levels and otherwise meets acceptable performance levels. The subordinates had also seen an almost the same scenario as those of the women managers. There is a thin line between the acceptable level and above acceptable level of performance of the women managers. However, it gives an almost similar result.
Recommendations:
As unfolded by the level of performance of women managers as determined by the information rated by their subordinates, it can be noted that there might be a misinterpretation of a woman managers level of performance by their subordinates. The women manager is recommended to reach out more to her people in the organization. For women managers, rating oneself may be an over statement or understatement. In whatever category they might fall, it will be easier to blend in honesty with humility.

**Problem 3.**
Are there significant differences in the ratings given by the two groups of respondents?

**Hypothesis:**
1. There is a significant difference in the women managers’ management styles as determined by themselves and their subordinates.
2. There is a significant difference in the job performance of women managers as determined by themselves and their subordinates.

**Findings:**
A T test value of 2.529 and a sig. value of .016 were the result of the T test to determine the significant difference between the ratings of women managers and their subordinates on the management styles of the women managers.

A T test value of -7.197 and a sig. value of .000 were the result of the T test to determine the significant difference between the ratings of women managers and their subordinates on the job performance of women managers.

**Conclusion:**
There is a significant difference on the ratings of women managers and their subordinates on the management styles of the women managers.

There is a significant difference on the ratings of women managers and their subordinates on the job performance of the women managers.

Recommendations:
The ratings of the women managers to themselves and their subordinates, according to what their management style is and their job performance may be enhanced through proper communication and channeling of work in an organization. A manager’s management style may be rated objectively if the subordinate is contented with his/her present job stature. Whereas, a manager’s job performance may also be objectively rated by a subordinate through a conducive working environment that will not only be conducive to subordinates but to women managers as well.

**Problem 4.**
Is there a significant relationship between the level of performance of women managers and their management styles?

**Hypothesis:**
There is a significant relationship between the level of performance of women managers and their management styles.

**Findings:**
The Pearson P result of .101 and a sig. value of .456 were derived in finding the significant relationship between the level of performance of women managers and their management styles.

**Conclusion:**
Hence, there is no significant relationship between the level of performance of women managers and their management styles.

**Recommendations:**
It is highly recommended that women managers continue to enhance their education in the certain fields that they may be in. This is so, so that they may be able to maintain or improve their level of job performance and work competencies.

Moreover, a better way to improve the management style of these women managers is for them to be able to find themselves observant and sensitive to
Ma. Angela Josefa Gonzales Pioquinto

Problem 5.
What management strategies may be proposed to enhance the performance of women managers as prime mover for the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC)?

Findings:
From all the management practices and leadership styles exemplified, and the challenges encountered, the researcher believed that management strategies be proposed to feature ways that will prove innovative and enhance the performance of women managers and their subordinates in a certain organization.

Conclusion:
The management strategies proposed by the researcher may substantiate and enhance the job performance of women managers and their subordinates by being able to seek solutions to problems, foster group collaboration and camaraderie, implement strategic decisions and initiate organizational changes.

Recommendations:
As unfolded in the management styles of women managers derived from them and their subordinates as key respondents, from all the management issues and conflicting answers disclosed in the research, the researcher hereby recommends the proposal of management strategies to enhance the performance of women managers and their subordinates.

References

BOOKS

Peter F. Drucker. 2007. Innovation and Entrepreneurship, Elenver House, USA.
Peter F. Drucker. 2011. People and Performance, Routledge, New York, USA.
John Gettings. 2007. Profiles of Leading Female CEO’s and Business Executives, Person Education, Inc., USA.

Published Master Thesis, Research Papers and Articles
Sandrine Devillard, et.al. 2013. “Gender Diversity in Top


**Online Sources**


**Manual**


T. Clifton Green, Narasimham Jegadeesh and Yu Tang. 2009. Gender and Job Performance: Evidence from Wall Street. Emory University, Atlanta, USA.


